### University of New Orleans ScholarWorks@UNO

University of New Orleans Theses and Dissertations

**Dissertations and Theses** 

Summer 8-6-2013

### Invisible Women: Examining the Political, Economic, Cultural, and Social Factors that lead to Human Trafficking and Sex Slavery of Young Girls and Women

Robyn L. White University of New Orleans, rlwhite2@uno.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.uno.edu/td

Part of the International Relations Commons

### **Recommended Citation**

White, Robyn L., "Invisible Women: Examining the Political, Economic, Cultural, and Social Factors that lead to Human Trafficking and Sex Slavery of Young Girls and Women" (2013). *University of New Orleans Theses and Dissertations*. 1708.

https://scholarworks.uno.edu/td/1708

This Thesis is protected by copyright and/or related rights. It has been brought to you by ScholarWorks@UNO with permission from the rights-holder(s). You are free to use this Thesis in any way that is permitted by the copyright and related rights legislation that applies to your use. For other uses you need to obtain permission from the rights-holder(s) directly, unless additional rights are indicated by a Creative Commons license in the record and/or on the work itself.

This Thesis has been accepted for inclusion in University of New Orleans Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks@UNO. For more information, please contact scholarworks@uno.edu.

Invisible Women: Examining the Political, Economic, Cultural, and Social Factors that lead to Human Trafficking and Sex Slavery of Young Girls and Women

A Thesis

Submitted to the Graduate Faculty of the University of New Orleans in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

> Master of Arts in Political Science International Relations

> > by

Robyn L. White

B.A. University of Southern Mississippi, 2008

August, 2013

For Mimi

### Table of Contents

List of figures	iv
Abstract	V
Chapter 1	1
Introduction	
Chapter 2	7
Literature Review and Hypotheses and Design	
Chapter 3	
Data Analyses	25
Chapter 4	
Further Research	
References	53
Vita	59

### List of Figures

Table I	8
UNODC TIP Report 2006: Incidence of Reporting of Origin Countries	8
Table II	26
Descriptive Statistics	26
Table III	27
OLS Regression Results	27
Table IV	35
Summary of Results	35
Table V	36
Summary of Models	

### Abstract

This thesis employs the most recent and best available data on human trafficking, the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime's Trafficking in Persons Global Report 2006, as well as nine independent variables to determine what their effects are on countries' volumes of human trafficking outflows. By completing a cross-sectional analysis via an OLS regression, I found statistically significant support for three factors that I hypothesize lead to greater outflows of human trafficking. My findings suggest that countries that are less corrupt, have more seats in parliament held by women, and score higher on Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer's Anti-Trafficking Policy Index are less likely to experience high outflows of human trafficking. Additionally, while they narrowly avoid statistical significance, this study also suggests that states that have a legal stance on prostitution and have fewer women employed in the non-agricultural sector experience less human trafficking outflows.

Human Trafficking, Sex Trafficking, Women's Rights, Economic Opportunities, Patriarchy, Women in Politics

#### **Chapter I: Introduction**

Srey Rath is fifteen years old and lives in Cambodia. While American girls her age spend their days attending high school and thinking about prom dresses or getting their drivers licenses, Srey's daily routine is quite different. Forced to work sunrise to sunset, Srey has little time to do activities she enjoys. In fact, if she is not working, she is usually sleeping as the physical demands made of her each and every day are more than any person, least a child, should ever be forced to endure. Srey, like so many young female girls in Cambodia and throughout the world, has fallen prey to one of the world's most violent acts against humanity: sex trafficking (Kristof and WuDunn 2010).

Like many families in Cambodia, Srey's family was unable to support themselves and thus was forced to consider options that would alleviate their financial duress. A promising option seemed to come to them when a man offered to take Srey and her friends to Thailand where they would earn good money by working in a restaurant for two months. This seemed like a sound plan to Srey's family who were excited about the fact that Srey would be earning enough money to send some back to them. Srey never made it to Thailand and never began work in a restaurant. Srey was instead smuggled into Malaysia and sold to a brothel where she was forced to have sex with throngs of men, typically for fifteen hours each day, every day of the week. She was kept naked most of the time to dissuade her and the other girls from running away or from retaining tips given to them by customers. She was also forbidden to ask her "customers" to wear a condom, thus putting herself at a high risk of contracting a sexually transmitted disease. She did not receive one cent of what she 'earned' and no money was ever sent back to her family. Sensing that she would consider fleeing the brothel, the owner warned her that if she fled her family would be killed. Furthermore, if Srey was caught even attempting to leave the

brothel, the punishment promised was a debilitating beating at best. Incredibly, knowing these risks did not stop Srey from running away and going to the police for help. After arriving at the local police station, however, she was raped and then re-sold to the very place from which she ran away (Kristof and WuDunn 2010). Escaping this hell on earth seemed increasingly impossible to her with each passing day.

Srey's story is told by journalists Nicholas Kristof and Cheryl WuDunn in their book Half the Sky (2010) and is unfortunately far from unique. Today it is estimated that 20.9 million (ILO 2013) to 27 million (Free the Slaves 2013) men, women, and children have fallen victim to the "white slave trade" (Kempadoo and Doezema 1998) or what is more commonly known as human trafficking. Human trafficking is defined as any activity that "involves an act of recruiting, transporting, transferring, harboring, or receiving a person through use of force, coercion or other means, for the purpose of exploiting them" according to the United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime (2012). In every part of the world, men, women, and children are forced against their will to engage in sexual acts as a result of being trafficked both within their own country and across international borders. Sex trafficking is believed to be the most common form of human trafficking, with estimates of 70% (Trafficking.Org 2013) to 79% (UNODC 2013) of human trafficking victims being sexually exploited.<sup>1</sup> Estimates of the number of people being trafficked annually for commercial sex range from 600,000-800,000 (U.S. Department of State 2011, Trafficking.Org 2013). Estimates of the number of current victims of sex trafficking there are worldwide are disparate, ranging from 1.4 million (Omaar 2012) to 3 million (Kristof

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> While most literature refers to human trafficking in general, the fact that the majority of human trafficking is sex trafficking permits the interchangeable usage of "human trafficking" and "sex trafficking."

and WuDunn 2012a) to as high as 15 million (Trafficking.Org 2013).<sup>2</sup> Regardless of the actual magnitude, it is undeniable that trafficking (especially sex trafficking) has become an increasingly world-wide threat, especially for young girls and women who are believed to make up 80% of trafficking victims worldwide (Trafficking.Org 2013, Kristof and WuDunn 2012a). Trafficking has become the fastest growing sector of organized crime within the United States and is likely to hold a similar ranking worldwide (Federal Bureau of Investigation 2012). With such staggering statistics and no shortage of heart-wrenching accounts of survivors of the forced commercial sex industry, the urgency for methods to combat these evils grows each day.

Most young women fall victim to sex trafficking due to relatively similar recruitment tactics. One of the most popular methods of recruitment is for parents of young girls and young women themselves to fall victim to an enticing advertisement for restaurant or retail work, often abroad (HumanTrafficking.Org 2006). These advertisements promise greater earning potential than the victims are able to achieve in their own country and thus are highly attractive. Thus some victims, like Srey, go willingly with traffickers who deceive them as well as their families that they will be taken care of physically as well as financially. These victims and their families, upon being presented with an opportunity to 'save' their children and to bring in extra revenue at the same time are understandably quite anxious to do so. In other cases, victims may even feel so indebted to their families that they 'seek' being trafficked as a way to pay back or honor their families (Kara 2009). Even if they are not sex trafficked, many victims are forced into jobs that are arguably comparably grueling, in domestic servitude or other types of 'employment' where

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The estimate of 15 million comes from Trafficking.Org's estimate that there are 27 million victims of human trafficking worldwide, 80% of which are women, and 70% of these female victims are victims of sex trafficking. Thus this value of 15 million is derived from  $27,000,000^{*}(.80^{*}.70) = 15,120,000$ .

the wages are far from commensurate for the work being done or promised (Department of Homeland Security 2012).

While it is true that human trafficking is a widespread problem that affects men and young boys as well as young girls and women the majority of victims, an estimated 80% are women (UNDOC 2006, Trafficking.Org 2013). This study focuses upon the trafficking of women, especially women who are sex trafficked. In determining what makes a country more likely to act as a 'feeder' that produces victims of human trafficking, it is essential to focus on societal factors that affect women in that country, rendering them more susceptible to being victimized. It is widely acknowledged that in nearly every country worldwide women are subjected to second-class citizen status. Women in well developed nations still earn significantly less than their male counterparts and women in less developed nations are subjected to inequalities that far exceed pay gaps. While there may be innumerable explanations for why this is so, much of it can be attributed to the various cultural, economic, and political or state-level factors in a given country. Moreover, much of human trafficking can be attributed to the ways that these aforementioned factors create gender biases against women (Kara 2009). Researchers of human trafficking have arrived at the consensus that females are trafficked because of a lack of economic opportunities and low levels of empowerment. Thus, exploring the ways that women and young girls are both nationally and globally disenfranchised will provide greater insight into not only what types of women and girls are at a greater risk of being trafficked but also what can be done to quell this worldwide epidemic.

The 2006 United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime's Trafficking in Persons Global Patterns report collected information from victims of human trafficking, including country of origin, whether they had been trafficked through transit countries, etc. This information allowed

researchers to create tiers for each country based upon the frequency of reported national origin by trafficking victims. From this report, 126 countries were classified as countries of origin for victims of human trafficking. These countries were then ranked as: very high, high, medium, low, or very low in accordance with the number of their citizens who were victims of human trafficking between 1996 and 2003. These data are the only quantitative measure of levels of human trafficking available. Since human trafficking is such an illicit activity, precise numbers or even estimates of victims are guesses at best. Still, this data remains the best available to date. Consequently, these data will be utilized as the dependent variable in this study.

As the majority of human trafficking victims are young women, it is imperative to examine how females are treated in societies that makes them the most vulnerable demographic for human trafficking. Research on human trafficking suggests that poverty, fewer education opportunities, and overall unequal treatment of women are what lead females to be victimized via human trafficking. Thus, I examine the ways in which cultural/social, economic, and political or state-level variables affect human trafficking. These variables are: the ratio of girls to boys enrolled in primary and secondary school, the percentage of women employed in the nonagricultural sector, GDP per PPP, the level of democracy (Polity scores), the percentage of women who serve as representatives in the national parliament, time elapsed since the last civil conflict, the level of corruption, anti-trafficking policies, and the legal status of prostitution.

By using the UNODC's ranking of 126 countries of origin for victims of human trafficking (2006) as a dependent variable and the aforementioned factors as independent variables, this thesis seeks to test the general hypothesis that countries that are culturally/socially repressive towards women, economically weaker, and politically less proactive against factors that allow illicit activities to occur, are more likely to be countries in which the outflow of human

sex trafficking thrives. While my selection of independent variables is inspired by existing literature on sex trafficking, the specific variables I have chosen have not yet been examined quantitatively by researchers. As very little work has been done examining sex trafficking on a global scale, a quantitative analysis is appropriate. Thus, this thesis seeks to provide greater insight into the causes of human trafficking and sex trafficking worldwide and to provide specific suggestions about how the phenomenon—and the number of experiences like Srey Rath's-- may be effectively reduced.

Of the nine independent variables examined in this thesis, three demonstrate statistically significant relationships with the dependent variable. These variables are: corruption, the percentage of women in national parliament, and Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer's Anti-Trafficking Index. Additionally, there are two variables that demonstrate statistical significance at the 90% confidence interval—the legal status of prostitution and the percentage of women employed in the non-agricultural sector. The findings in this thesis make significant contributions to human trafficking literature in several ways. First, as very few studies attempt a quantitative analysis on human trafficking, this study adds to a very small body of research. Second, the variables used in this study, while some are derived from popular theory regarding human trafficking outflows. Specifically, I did not discover any other studies that examine my particular variables of the percentage of women employed in the non-agricultural sector as well as the legal status of prostitution in relation to human trafficking outflows. Thus, this thesis contributes substantial findings to research on human trafficking.

#### **Chapter II: Literature Review and Hypotheses**

Sex trafficking is a phenomenon occurring across the globe, in rich and poor nations alike. However, despite its magnitude, there remains very little quantitative research on the topic. As Tyldum and Brunovskis (2005) explain, this is largely due to the fact that victims of sex trafficking are a part of a "hidden population" which makes them nearly impossible to gain access to for either quantitative or qualitative studies. This study is one of the few that attempts a quantitative analysis of sex trafficking victims worldwide.

The highest susceptibility to being trafficked stems from a factor that victims have no control over: being born female (Coalition Against Trafficking in Women 2001, Cho 2012). Patriarchal views of women often contribute to females' susceptibility to being trafficked. Patriarchal societies view women as second-class citizens and consequently extend fewer opportunities to them. The largest and most evident result of limiting women's opportunities is the fact that women are disproportionately poorer than their male counterparts, accounting for 70% of the world's poor (Global Poverty Project 2013). Literature suggests that poorer countries that do not extend equal opportunities to women are the ones in which women are highly susceptible to becoming victims of sex trafficking. Literature also suggests that poor economic conditions and an array of other state factors may also contribute to the greater likelihood of females being trafficked for sex. Thus, the research reviewed here explores how economic and state factors as well as the various inequalities (or lack of opportunities) that women are subjected to puts them are at a greater risk of being sex trafficked.

Following an introduction of the dependent variable, I explore literature on how patriarchy affects the likelihood of females being trafficked, which leads to one hypothesis. Next, I discuss how economic factors lead to females being disproportionately disadvantaged and thus more likely to be trafficked, which results in two more hypotheses. Lastly, I also survey literature that discusses how various state-level factors (democracy level, percentage of female representatives in national parliament, civil conflict, corruption, anti-trafficking policies, and the legal status of prostitution) are believed to affect human trafficking outflows as well, which leads to six additional hypotheses.

While it is not known precisely how many people are trafficked each year, data does exist on what are believed to be the most common countries of origin for victims of human trafficking. The 2006 United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime's Trafficking in Persons Global Patterns report (UNODC 2006) presents an overview of victims of human trafficking worldwide. In this report, accounts of victims are collected from 113 sources worldwide, totaling 4,950 accounts, collected from 1996-2003. These sources include local and national newspapers, journals, websites, etc. Each country reported in these sources was placed into one of five tiers. Depending upon the volume of victims of human trafficking that reported a given country as their country of origin, a country is deemed as a very high, high, medium, low, or a very low place of origin of human trafficking victims. Overall, 126 countries were reported as origins of victims of human trafficking. Criteria for categorization into the tiers are as follows:

#### Table 1

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime's Trafficking in Persons Global Patterns report (UNODC 2006)

Number of Reports	Citation Range Index	Total # of Countries
1	Very Low	13
2-4	Low	30
5-10	Medium	46
11-23	High	27
24-49	Very High	11

The main limitation of these data concerns the manner in which they were generated.

Actual head counts of the number of victims are not assessed in this source. For instance, if a

newspaper article reported the discovery of a brothel that held nine victims of sex trafficking, this was entered into the database as one instance of trafficking. Other articles that reported that a single sex trafficking victim had been rescued were also entered into the database as one instance of trafficking. This is problematic in that each case is weighted equally but the actual number of victims could range from one to many. This report claims that this is done so as to essentially balance out another problem the data are subject to—doubly counting a case. Both local and national newspapers may report a case, leading to double-counting of cases. No concentrated effort was made to ascertain whether multiple sources were reporting the same incident. Thus, in an effort to make up for that overestimate, the researchers decided to underestimate the volume of trafficking by counting each incident (rather than each victim) as a case. This coding rule is obviously highly problematic. Additionally, these data only cover cases of human trafficking that were discovered. Human trafficking is undoubtedly much, much larger than what is presented here. These data also do not account for trafficking within a state, as they are exclusively focused on international trafficking. Unfortunately, no other sources of data measuring the volume of human trafficking are available, and thus this study uses these however flawed-data as the dependent variable.

Finally, the UNODC report (2006) does not collect data across time. Thus, this study uses a cross-sectional design to examine the causes of trafficking. While a cross-sectional analysis itself is not the best design, data limitations restrict use of more robust designs, as Kelly and Regan (2000) note. In constructing a cross-sectional research design, one year needed to be selected for which to collect the independent variables' data. As the dependent variable was collected over a period of seven years (1996-2003) and published in 2006, I selected 2006 as the year to examine these variables for several reasons. One, while much of the data on the

independent variables exists for many countries today, much data regarding the independent variables was not available for all countries prior to 2006. Second, as significant change regarding these independent variables typically takes a considerable amount of time, I expect little variation in the values across such limited time (1996-2006).<sup>3</sup> Third, I selected 2006 as the year to collect my data in as this is the last year that these variables could accurately be measured ensuring that the report did not create an outlier effect, or a quick, short-lived change by a government in order to reduce the negative connotations of an unsatisfactory report.

In most cases when 2006 data was not available, I was able to refer to 2005 data. In very few cases, I had to retrieve my data from a few years prior (but never prior to 1996). In general, many of the variables discussed below do not vary much over short periods of time. Since the major source of variance is cross-sectional rather than temporal, this decision is acceptable in a pilot study such as this. I have elected to use OLS in lieu of maximum likelihood techniques as the range of the dependent variable is 1-5, approximating the requirements of OLS. Results using other techniques were not substantially different, as discussed in the next chapter. Overall, I have no reason to believe that data integrity was compromised as a result of collecting 2006 data.

### Causes of Human Trafficking

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Limited time here references the period from 1996, the year the dependent variable data began to be collected through 2006, the year the dependent variable was published.

#### **I.Patriarchy**

Girls receive less education than boys worldwide (United Nations 2000, Kristof and WuDunn 2010, DoSomething.Org 2012, Day of the Girl 2012, Global Campaign for Education 2013). Girls who receive little education are at a high risk of being trafficked (Chuang 2006, McCarter 2006, Corrin 2005, Lehti and Aromaa 2006, Samarasinghe and Burton 2007, Omorodion 2009, Cho 2012, Day of the Girl 2012). In a study of African nations, Samarasinghe and Burton (2007) find that the largest population at risk for sex trafficking is females aged 5-25, from rural places, poor, and with little education. Lehti and Aromaa (2006) claim that that the same demographic is of the highest risk of being trafficked in Africa, Latin America, and South/Southeast Asia. Further, Reed et al. (2010) survey sex workers in India's Andhra Pradesh (an area well known for its commercial sex industry) and find that the majority of the female sex workers had completed less than a high school education and that 70% were illiterate. When Omorodion (2009) asked Nigerians if they thought that illiteracy contributes to the likelihood of girls being trafficked, 46% said that they believed it does. As Kristof and WuDunn (2013) assert, access to education prepares girls with the skills necessary for future job opportunities and for higher wages. Patriarchal societies that do not extend women equal rights as men, especially via education, strip girls of the most essential tools they need to become successful, thus significantly diminishing the options they have to ensure their survival. Limited opportunities lead to a greater likelihood of girls and women being trafficked. Thus, this leads to my first hypothesis:

H : As girls receive greater access to education, the level of outbound human trafficking will decrease.

To test this hypothesis I use data from The World Bank that measures the ratio of girls to boys in primary and secondary education (%) recorded in 2006 (World Bank 2006c). As this variable directly compares the access to education that girls have to boys, it is a good measure of the extent to which girls are disadvantaged in their early life. This variable is also suggestive of the level of patriarchy in a society. Most research on human trafficking asserts that less educated females (with consequently fewer opportunities) are at a significantly higher risk of being trafficked. However, there are some studies that suggest that less education does not always equate to a decreased likelihood of being trafficked. While they maintain that decreased access to education often leads to girls being trafficked in Africa, Latin America, and South/Southeast Asia, Lehti and Aromaa's (2006) study also finds that victims of human trafficking from Eastern European countries are generally older and have higher levels of education. In fact, Lehti and Aromaa reference Kaufmann and Zwettler's 2004 study that finds as many as one third of trafficking victims from Eastern Europe hold university degrees. Corrin (2005) and Samarasinghe and Burton (2007) also claim that higher education does not necessarily equate to the lesser likelihood of being trafficked. Samarasinghe and Burton (2007) assert that well educated women in Eastern Europe with urban backgrounds are at a greater risk of being trafficked due to other motives (i.e. marrying or working abroad) than non-educated rural girls. Thus, it is clear that education can have varied effects for trafficking outflows, often depending upon other factors. However, the majority of research points to lower education levels contributing to higher outflows of human trafficking, which helps create my hypothesis.

#### **II.Economics**

One of the largest motives that drive women to being trafficked is poor economic opportunities (Oudtshoorn 2005, Danailova-Trainor and Belser 2006, Cho 2012). This is evident

in Omorodion's study (2009) which asks Nigerians what they think are the leading causes of human trafficking in their country. Respondents report that the reason they feel their nationals are at such a high risk of being sex trafficked is due to the fact that Nigeria operates under a largely patriarchal structure that "offers no role for women" and through which "gender inequality pervades all aspects of life" especially via job opportunities. Women are at an increased risk for being trafficked when there is a lack of available, sufficient employment opportunities (Fenster 1999; Papart, Rai, and Staudt 2002; Chuang 2006; Danailova-Trainor and Belser 2006; Samarasinghe and Burton 2007; Omorodion 2009; Cho 2012). Thus, it is logical to assume that higher rates of female unemployment may equate to higher rates of human trafficking, as Danailova-Trainor and Belser (2006) suggest in their study of human trafficking outflows from five Eastern European countries. Along the same argument, it would seem logical that countries that have, for instance, a high percentage of women employed in the agricultural sector, would be less likely to have high outflows of human trafficking, as Cho (2012) finds. However, sources also suggest that employment in extremely low paying sectors, such as the agricultural sector, may also render women more susceptible to being trafficked (UNODC 2013, Mahmoud and Trebesch 2009, Academy for Educational Development 2013). In many states entrenched in patriarchy, women are segregated into labor-intensive, low-wage agricultural work whereas males are more likely to be able to obtain industrial and service jobs at higher pay (Food and Agricultural Organization of the United Nations 2013). This leaves women with very few, if any alternatives to "3D jobs"—jobs that are difficult, dirty, dangerous, and often poorly paid--which renders them more susceptible to seek risky employment options and consequently be trafficked (Mahmoud and Trebesch 2009).

Measuring patriarchy is difficult to do in that it is an abstract social construct relatively defined in each society. Measuring economic opportunities for women is also difficult to do in that the definition of such extends beyond employment or unemployment of women. However, the percentage of women employed in the non-agricultural sector can serve as a proxy for patriarchy and economic opportunities for women in that it represents the extent to which women are allowed to obtain better paying work. This leads to my second hypothesis:

# H**□**: As women are granted more economic opportunities, the amount of human trafficking out of that country will decrease.

To test this hypothesis, I use data from The World Bank that measure the share of women employed in the nonagricultural sector (% of total nonagricultural employment) from 2006 (World Bank 2006d). I select this variable carefully as it accomplishes two goals. First, as unemployment can exist for many reasons (ranging from women not being allowed to work to women choosing not to work) simply measuring unemployment rates of women do not accurately serve as a measure of patriarchy or economic opportunities for women. However, the percentage of women employed in the nonagricultural sector measures of the lack or extent of opportunities (and hence, I argue, of patriarchy) that exists in a country and is thus an innovative, appropriate variable to examine in relation to the dependent variable.

Sources arrive at a consensus that poor people are at a greater risk of being by trafficked (Fenster 1999, Corrin 2005, Lehti and Aromaa 2006, Samarasinghe and Burton 2007, Omorodion 2009). Although the poverty of a nation certainly affects both men and women, the effects are often magnified for women (Corrin 2005, Leach and Sitaram 2002, Danailova-Trainor and Belser 2006). As women are typically left with the financial responsibility to ensure things such as adequate nutrition and education for their children (Corrin 2005, McCarter 2006, Reed et

al. 2010), the fact that they make up 70% of the world's poor means that poverty disproportionately effects them (Global Poverty Project 2013). Corrin (2005) refers to this as the "feminization of poverty" which has become a key factor in the 'decision' of women to seek risky alternatives for employment that can lead to trafficking (Danailova-Trainor and Belser 2006).

Lehti and Aromaa (2006) find that economic motives are what led 93% of the Bosnian women they interviewed to being trafficked. Reed et al. (2010) make a similar discovery in their survey of Indian sex workers<sup>4</sup> where 75% of respondents reported that ensuring economic stability for themselves and their families was what led them into commercial sex work. Also, 77.2% of Nigerian respondents in Omorodion's (2009) study respond that they believed poverty is the largest factor that drives girls and women to become victims of sex trafficking.<sup>5</sup> Thus, it is clear that states with limited economic opportunities for women can contribute greatly to higher outflows of human trafficking.

Measuring economic opportunities is difficult to do since, like patriarchy, it is relative to each state. However, as wealthier countries are able to extend greater and better paying employment opportunities to their people, and as GDP per PPP is an indicator of the economic wealth of a country, GDP per PPP could be used as a proxy for the status of economic opportunities in a country. This leads to my next hypothesis:

 $H\Box$  = As the level of a country's wealth increases, the outflow of human trafficking will decrease.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Some of which were trafficking victims and some of which were not.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Relatedly, respondents also reported that the following conditions also contribute to human trafficking: unemployment (68.4%), illiteracy (56.1%), and low social status (44.5%).

To test this hypothesis I am using the GDP per capita, PPP data from The World Bank (2006a). By integrating purchasing power parity (PPP) into GDP per capita, this variable controls for price differentials across countries. Also, as Danailova-Trainor and Belser (2006) suggest, purchasing power of the population is one of the leading factors that renders a state's people likely to be trafficked. While there are other indicators that are more desirable for estimating poverty, (such as the percentage of the population living below the national poverty line) these data are not available for many countries during the period studied here, thus resulting my selection of this particular indicator. The higher a country's GDP per capita PPP is, the more economically healthy the country and its people should be. Although women are disproportionately poorer than men, they are less likely to be so in a country that has a stronger economy and hence a stronger GDP per PPP. Thus, a high GDP per capita PPP should be associated with less susceptibility to trafficking.

#### **III.State Factors**

Thus far, I have focused on how societal and economic variables contribute to the greater likelihood of females being trafficked. The final section of this chapter focuses on how additional state factors contribute to a greater flow of human trafficking. These factors are: level of democracy, female representation in parliament, civil conflict, corruption, states' antitrafficking policies, and the legal state of prostitution.

A democratic government is one that extends equal rights to all of its citizens. Many of the factors that contribute to the likelihood of a girl or woman being trafficked come as a result of equal rights not being granted to females, such as access to education, employment, etc. (Fenster 1999; Lehti and Aromaa 2000; Papart, Rai, and Staudt 2002; Chuang 2006; Danailova-Trainor and Belser 2006, Samarasinghe and Burton 2007; Omorodion 2009, Cho 2012). Thus, a

democratic government is more likely to yield a society in which many of the factors that contribute to the greater likelihood of a female being trafficked are reduced. Additionally, as democratic governments are ruling bodies that respect laws, protect the rights of minorities, and guarantee basic human rights, they are less likely to tolerate human trafficking. Further, they ensure these standards are upheld by creating and enforcing laws to punish those who break them. Authoritarian regimes, however, are known to violate these norms, thus making trafficking more likely to occur in their states. Therefore, democracies should have less human trafficking than authoritarian states. This yields my next hypothesis:

# H $\Box$ : The more democratic a country's government is, the less likely it is to experience human trafficking.

I measure the level of democracy in countries via Polity IV scores for 2006 (Center for Systemic Peace 2011). The Polity IV scale assigns each country a numerical value based upon its level of regime authority. The scale ranges twenty points (from -10 to +10), where -10 represents a hereditary monarchy and +10 represents a consolidated democracy. Since a democratic state is likely one that affords women opportunities and equality, I hypothesize that the higher the Polity IV score, the less likelihood that women from that country will be trafficked.

Another variable that literature states can have an effect on the outflows of human trafficking is female parliamentary representation. Female parliamentary representatives are more inclined and naturally positioned, as females, to advocate for women's rights and to support and ensure the passage of laws that protect women (Palmer and Simon 2008; Wolbrecht, Beckwith, and Baldez 2008; McBride and Parry 2011). Countries that have a larger proportion of parliamentary seats held by women are also generally better supporters of social issues and

human rights, particularly as they pertain to women. As human trafficking disproportionately affects women and is such a large violation of human rights (especially women's rights), it is logical then that female representatives would be instrumental in creating stiffer penalties for human traffickers, thus reducing the volume of trafficking (Cho 2012, Bartilow 2010). Conversely, male representatives are less likely to give issues that disproportionately affect women the same attention, priority, and enforcement that female representatives do. Thus, if males are almost entirely representing a state, women's issues, such as the spread of human trafficking, are even more likely to be overlooked. Accordingly, it seems logical, as Corrin (2005) claims, that higher percentages of women in parliament would decrease the level of human trafficking out of a country. Thus, my next hypothesis is:

### **H**□: As women's issues garner greater priority, there will be less human trafficking.

I am employing the percentage of seats held by women in national parliaments (in 2006) from The World Bank to test this hypothesis (World Bank 2006b). The range of these values is from 2%-49%, based upon the countries listed in the UNODC's (2006) report for the dependent variable in this study. With this wide range of percentages, I am able to test what extent both very minimal female representation and near gender parity of parliamentary representation have on trafficking outflows. As hypothesized, I presume that the greater the percentage of female parliamentary representatives, the less human trafficking that flows out of that country.

Existing literature asserts that a state's infrastructure is weakened by instances of civil conflict (Corrin 2005, Danailova-Trainor and Belser 2006, Samarasinghe and Burton 2007, Kristof and WuDunn 2010, Bolkovac 2011, Cho 2012). In general, states in civil conflict exhibit less capacity to maintain law and order. As a country enters into civil conflict, it is forced to abruptly allocate resources to new areas. This means that countries engaged in civil conflict are

left with fewer resources with which to maintain the same levels of, for example, personal security that they had prior to the conflict. Measures to combat illicit activities may not be met with equal vigor once a state is engaged in conflict. Further, given that the countries often engaged in civil conflict are some of the world's lesser developed countries that already may possess weak state infrastructures, civil conflict only increases the attractiveness of these states to traffickers (Cho 2012). Thus, as civil conflict weakens state infrastructure and capacity, traffickers can operate more freely than they would under normal circumstances, hence increasing the volume of women trafficked (Danailova-Trainor and Belser 2006, Cho 2012).

Although civil conflicts affect everyone in a country, women often become the "invisible casualties" of such events (Corrin 2005). With their sons and husbands away and the attention of their state suddenly diverted, there are few resources that are left to combat the trafficking of women, especially in states that may already experience higher trafficking volumes (due to weak economies, etc.). In civil conflicts, women often become targets, subject to mass rapes as well as sex trafficking (Kristof and WuDunn 2010). Samarasinghe and Burton (2007) and Bolkovac (2011) discuss sex trafficking in war-torn Kosovo and Bosnia in the late 1990s. Both works argue that sex trafficking simply would not have been possible on the scale that it existed in the late 1990s had civil conflict not devastated the country. Thus, the presence of civil conflict is a factor to consider when determining what may lead to greater outflows of human trafficking. This leads to my next hypothesis:

# H $\Box$ : The more recently a country's infrastructure has been weakened, the greater outflow of human trafficking that should emerge from that country.

To test this hypothesis, I use data from the PRIO Conflict Data set (Gleditsch et al. 2009). As my dependent variable's data was collected from 1996-2003 and published in 2006, and as the results of civil conflict are often evident both immediately and in the years after the conflict has ended, I elected to examine whether or not a state was engaged in conflict between 1996-2006. Some of the effects of a civil conflict can occur immediately following the conflict, whereas others may take years to attenuate. Thus, it is important to examine the proximity of the conflict. In order to test for this, I created a scale that assigned states a numeric value based upon the number of years since their last active civil conflict, starting with 1996. As I surveyed a decade (1996-2006) of civil conflicts, my scale ranged from 0-11. For example, a state that was not engaged in any civil conflict during that time was assigned a 0; a state that was engaged in civil conflict in 1996 was assigned a 1; in 1997, a 2, etc. until the final year, where a state that was engaged in civil conflict in 2006 was assigned an 11. I hypothesize that a more recent civil conflict will prohibit a state from adequately fighting against human trafficking. Although no two civil conflicts are the same, by creating my own scale with PRIO's data, I am able to explore what effect civil conflict has on trafficking volumes as time elapses.

Corruption is another state factor that can enable greater volumes of human trafficking. Corrupt countries are generally environments that allow illicit activities to thrive. As the UNODC (2011) explains, corrupt countries can contribute to greater human trafficking at various steps within the process. Officials in corrupt states aid traffickers in recruiting trafficking victims (i.e. creating false passports of victims for use by traffickers), in violating criminal justice of traffickers (i.e. engaging in "acts of passivity" or allowing traffickers to cross borders), and in violating the protection of victims (i.e. returning a trafficking victim to her captor). Corrupt state officials are willing to engage in these acts as traffickers are often willing to provide them with bribes or financial incentives. Although these bribes can often be a substantial cost for traffickers –arguably the greatest cost traffickers may incur—this price is

relatively small when compared to the renewable wealth that trafficking victims provide (UNODC 2011, EUROPOL 2003). Thus, by "ignoring, tolerating, participating in or organizing trafficking in persons," corrupt public officials are essentially soliciting traffickers to operate in and out of their own country. This notion is supported by Danailova-Trainor and Belser (2006) as well as Cho (2012), who finds high corruption scores to be a statistically significant predictor of human trafficking outflows. Thus, this leads to my next hypothesis:

# H $\Box$ : The more corrupt a country is, the greater human trafficking outflow that will emerge from that state.

Transparency International computes CPI (Corruption Perception Index) scores for government corruption by taking into account perceptions of country experts, residents, and nonresidents during the year 2006 (Transparency International 2006). The range for this index goes from 0-10, with a 0 representing a country that is highly corrupt and a 10 representing a country that is not corrupt. Thus, the higher a country scores on Transparency International's scale, the less corrupt it is. As my hypothesis reflects, I expect to see less human trafficking flowing from countries that have higher CPI scores.

The level of sex trafficking flowing out of each country is often the result of action or inaction of the state. Thus an index that measures the strength of states' anti-trafficking policies should be directly associated with the volume of human trafficking each state experiences. The U.S. Department of State publishes annual Trafficking in Persons (TIP) reports based upon states' anti-trafficking policies. The U.S. Department of State assigns each country to one of three tiers. For example, membership in tier 3 (the worst tier) means a country is not and does not appear to be taking any actions toward combatting human trafficking. Thus, we would

logically expect to see higher volumes of human trafficking emerge from countries in the third tier.

The TIP report's scale has little variation in scores which has left it open to criticism. In response to the shortcomings of the TIP report, Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer (2012a) created an index that examined data collected by the TIP reports and re-assigned countries values ranging from 3-15. Focusing on the "3Ps"—prevention, protection and prosecution -- this scale assigned values of 1-5 (where 5 means a country has a strong anti-trafficking stance) for each country's action related to each "P." If a country has a higher numerical value on Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer's Anti-Trafficking Index, it is considered to be more actively engaged in fighting against human trafficking. As the focus of their index is to examine anti-trafficking solution of a country. A country that has stricter responses to human trafficking is probably one that would dissuade traffickers from operating in that country. Also, a country with stricter responses to human trafficking is also more likely to promote an increased awareness to prospective victims about the dangers of trafficking (Mahmoud and Trebesch 2009). This brings me to my next hypothesis:

# $H\square$ = The stronger a state's anti-trafficking policies are, the less human trafficking should flow from that state.

Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer's Anti-Trafficking Policy Index (2012a) scores every country's anti-trafficking policies annually from 2000-2011.<sup>6</sup> To stay consistent with the year of measurement for my dependent variable and other independent variables, I elected to collect data on states' 2006 scores in this index. As higher scores on this index equate to stronger anti-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> With the exception of a few states that they were unable to gain enough information about in order to create scores.

trafficking policies, I expect to see less human trafficking out of the states with higher scores in this index.

The last relationship explored in this thesis is the legal status of prostitution and its effect on human trafficking. Sources suggest that legalized prostitution increases the amount of sex trafficking in a state (U.S. Department of State 2004; Danailova-Trainor and Belser 2006; Cho 2012; Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer 2012b; Jakobsson and Kotsadam 2013). As they argue, the demand of commercial sex is higher in states where prostitution is legal. Thus, more women are needed to satisfy the demands for commercial sex in the state, leading to higher volumes of human trafficking (Danailova-Trainor and Belser 2006; Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer 2012b; Jakobsson and Kotsadam 2013). These arguments are logical but they are focused on the inflow of human trafficking rather than the outflow of it, upon which this thesis is focused. Only one source focuses on how the legal status of prostitution affects human trafficking inflows (Dicola et al. 2005). This source suggests that states that deem all aspects of prostitution (the sale and the purchase of sex) illegal have smaller outflows of human trafficking than those that partially or fully legalize prostitution. However, the findings in this source are relatively weak (and contrary to the researcher's own conjectures) and are a result of surveying only eleven European countries. Thus, this particular source (the only source that examines the legal status of prostitution and its effect on human trafficking outflows) does not adequately suggest that these findings may exist outside of this small sample.

Research suggests that sex workers in countries where prostitution is legal are well organized via unions (Oudtshoorn 2005, Persson-Stromback 2010). These unions work to ensure that sex workers have access to the same rights as women employed in other industries. Sex worker unions are likely to strongly lobby against human trafficking as they are support freedom

of choice for women in the sex industry and oppose all efforts to coerce women into the industry. As effective sex worker unions only exist in countries where prostitution is legal, it seems logical that states that have legalized prostitution would then have lower volumes of sex trafficking. This argument yields my final hypothesis:

# H $\Box$ : In countries where commercial sex is legal, there should be lesser outflows of human trafficking.

In order to test this hypothesis, I examined the legal status of prostitution in each country (Chartsbin 2013). I created a scale ranging from 0-2, where countries were coded as 0 where prostitution is illegal, 1 where it is partially legal, and 2 where it is completely legal. Thus, according to my hypothesis, the higher score a country receives in my scale of prostitution legality, the less human trafficking that should flow out of that state.

In sum, the existing literature suggests that there are many factors that can contribute to sex trafficking. Some of the variables that I chose to examine in this thesis are derived from the existing research on human trafficking, such as girls' access to education. However, many of the other variables are more specific than variables commonly used in human trafficking research. For instance, I use the percentage of women employed in non-agricultural work versus simply unemployment rates and I use GDP per PPP rather than simply GDP. My aim in choosing more specific variables is to arrive at more specific conclusions about the effects these variables have on human trafficking outflows. That many of these variables are not used in any other human trafficking research suggests that this thesis is unique and poised to make a significant contribution to existing human trafficking literature and research. Some literature suggests ambiguous relationships between particular independent variables and trafficking outflows (the dependent variable), and few of these hypothesized relationships have been subject to rigorous

empirical analysis. The extent to which these proposed factors (independent variables) are predictive of the levels of human trafficking (the dependent variable) will be examined in the next chapter to provide a greater, more in-depth understanding of the global phenomena that is human trafficking.

### **Chapter III: Data Analysis**

As presented in chapter two, the hypotheses and literature review chapter, this thesis seeks to explore the relationship between nine independent variables and the outflows of human trafficking. To test these hypotheses, I ran a cross-sectional analysis using an ordinary least squares regression. In order to ensure that the integrity of the data was not compromised by using OLS, I also ran an ordered logit regression to compare the results. The coefficients in both regressions are in the same direction and demonstrate similar levels of statistical significance. Therefore, for ease of interpretation, I have elected to use an OLS model for this thesis.

I also ran several OLS regressions<sup>7</sup> in which I dropped one independent variable at a time in order to see what effect this would have on the statistical significance of the coefficients. In all of my models, two of the coefficients are statistically significantly different from 0 at the 95% confidence interval. Thus, I was able to reject the null hypotheses that there is no relationship between these variables and the dependent variable. In six of the seven models, an additional coefficient remained statistically significant at the 95% confidence interval. Further, two of the coefficients showed statistical significance in four models at the 90% confidence interval. However, the remaining four coefficients were not statistically significantly different from 0 at the 95% or 90% confidence intervals. For this reason, I accepted the null hypotheses that there is no relationship between four of the independent variables and the dependent variable.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See Table V

Table I presents summary statistics of the OLS regression I chose to use for this thesis.<sup>8</sup>

### Table II: Descriptive Statistics

### Incidence of Reporting of Origin Countries for Human Trafficking (UNODC 2006)

Variable	Obs.	Mean	Std. Dev.	Min.	Max	Source
Education (♀:♂)	83	95.67	9.2	68	106	World Bank (2006)
$\mathcal{Q}$ in Non-Agricultural Sector	83	37.59	11.17	11	56	World Bank (2006)
GDP per capita, PPP (logged)	83	8.46	1.06	6.43	10.67	World Bank (2006)
Polity Scores	83	4.24	5.9	-9	10	Polity IV Scores
Gov. seats held by $\mathcal{Q}$	83	16.12	9.01	2	49	Word Bank (2006)
Last civil conflict	83	2.94	4.34	0	11	PRIO Conflict Data (2009)
Corruption Scores	83	3.44	1.46	1.9	8.7	Transparency International (2006)
Cho et al.'s Anti-Trafficking Index	83	9.93	2.44	4	15	Cho, Dreher, Neumayer's Anti- Trafficking Index (2011)
Legality of prostitution	83	0.94	0.98	0	2	Chartsbin (2013)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Note that the vast majority of values for each variable for each state were collected in 2006, the year that the UNODC Trafficking in Persons Global report was published. In rare occasions that data was unavailable for 2006, I used 2005 data. In very few instances, I was forced to refer to earlier years for data, but never prior to 1996, the year that the UNODC report began collecting data.

Trafficking Tier	Assigned Value
Very Low	1
Low	2
Medium	3
High	4
Very High	5

Recall from chapter two that the dependent variable is scaled as follows:

This means that the higher the value, the more victims of human trafficking emerging from that

state. Results for the OLS regression using this dependent variable are as follows:

### **Table III: OLS Regression Results**

### Incidence of Reporting of Origin Countries for Human Trafficking, UNODC 2006

Variable	Coefficient	Std. Error
Education $(\mathcal{Q}:\mathcal{J})$	-0.007	0.016
$\bigcirc$ Employed in Non-Agricultural sector	0.023	0.013
GDP per capita, PPP (logged)	0.184	0.164
Polity Scores	-0.025	0.012
Gov. seats held by $\stackrel{\bigcirc}{\downarrow}$	025*	0.012
Last civil conflict	-0.008	0.026
Corruption Scores	387***	0.099
Cho, Dreher, Neumayer's Anti-Trafficking Index	.148 **	0.055
Legality of prostitution	-0.221	0.123
Constant	2.02	1.31
Dequerade 2629		

R-squared: .3638

\*p<.05, \*\*p<.01, \*\*\*<.001

### I. Discussion

Of the nine independent variables examined in this thesis, three were found to have statistically significant relationships with the dependent variable--  $H\Box$ ,  $H\Box$ , and  $H\Box$ .  $H\Box$  states that the more corrupt a country is perceived to be, the more likely it is to experience an outflow of human trafficking. This hypothesis is supported and the coefficient of this variable is statistically significantly different from 0 at the 95% confidence level. As argued in the

hypothesis and design chapter, corrupt countries are generally environments that allow illicit activities such as human trafficking to thrive. Corrupt states allow and even contribute to the growth of human trafficking in many ways, from recruiting victims to allowing traffickers to enter states with their victims to refusing to assist victims seeking rescue. Corrupt states often do not enforce laws against those seeking to engage in illicit activities as officials in these states are often silenced with bribes. Additionally, corrupt states may not even create laws prohibiting illicit activities. Thus, as corrupt states offer little if any consequences for their actions, traffickers are effectively welcomed to operate within them. Thus, various facets of state corruption contribute greatly to the successful outflow of human traffickers.

Corruption scores (from Transparency International) of states studied in this thesis range from 1.9 to 8.7, where zero would represent a state that is perceived as entirely corrupt and ten would represent a state that is perceived as not at all corrupt. Given this range, the largest difference one could expect to see is 6.8 points. Therefore, holding all other variables constant, a coefficient of -.386 can result in a 2.62 point change on the human trafficking scale if varied from the minimum to the maximum of the dependent variable. Given that the dependent variable ranges from one through five, corruption is clearly an important determinant of trafficking. Since the dependent variable's mean is 3.23, which relates to a medium level of reported human trafficking incidences, a state that is perceived as not at all corrupt could reduce the average country's level of outbound trafficking from medium to very low. Conversely, a state that is perceived as highly corrupt could increase the average country's level of outbound trafficking from medium to very high. Thus, corruption has a strong influence on the outflow of human trafficking from countries.

 $H\square$  states that as the percentage of seats held by women in national parliament increases, there will be less human trafficking flowing from that country. This hypothesis is supported and the coefficient of this variable is also statistically different from 0 at the 95% confidence level. When women serve as national representatives, they are more likely to lobby for and pass legislation that benefits women (Palmer and Simon 2008; Wolbrecht, Beckwith, and Baldez 2008; McBride and Parry 2011). As human trafficking disproportionately affects women, it is logical then that female legislators would work to prevent this. One way that they may be able to prevent trafficking is by creating stronger legislation to punish traffickers, thus reducing the incentive and increasing the risk for traffickers. The effect of this variable on a country's human trafficking outflow is considerable as the values for female political representation actually range from 2%-49%. This means that the largest variation possible is 47 points. Given that the correlation is -.025, the largest effect that the percentage of female participation in parliament could have on the outflow of human trafficking is -1.17 points, just over a change from one tier to the next. As the mean of the dependent variable is 3.23, this means that high female political representation in parliament could reduce the average state's trafficking outflows by an entire tier. Conversely, very low female political representation in parliament could increase the average state's trafficking outflows by a tier. Further, it is likely that this variable has effects far beyond this simple measurement. The percentage of female participation in parliament could serve as a measure of women's rights and opportunities in that country. A country that has a high percentage of women in parliament likely also extends further rights and opportunities to women, thus rendering them less likely to be trafficked. Overall, it is understandable that a higher female representation in parliament leads to a lower outflow of human trafficking.

H□ argues that the stronger states' anti-trafficking policies are the less outbound trafficking they are likely to experience. Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer's scale (2012a) assigns countries a value based upon their prevention of human trafficking, protection of victims of human trafficking, and prosecution of human traffickers. Thus, it seems logical that a country that has strong anti-trafficking laws would also be a country that works to ensure a lower volume of human trafficking out of its borders. However, these data suggest the opposite. More stringent anti-trafficking laws seem to be associated with higher levels of trafficking. As the scale for the countries studied here runs from 4-15, the largest difference in these values is 11 points. Given that the coefficient is .148, the largest effect the scale could have on the amount of human trafficking flowing out of a country is 1.63 points. Considering that the dependent variable only ranges from 1-5, a difference of nearly two points is considerable, especially since this variable is statistically significant at a high confidence level of .95.

There are many reasons that this variable may have a positive effect on outflows of trafficking. First, the scale measures a country's human trafficking policies on three different levels, two of which deal strictly with a country's response to incidents of human trafficking that have already occurred. Simply put, this thesis focuses on factors that lead to women and girls becoming victims of human trafficking. Only one third of the Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer's index examines this question—the portion that measures the state's actions to prevent human trafficking. Rather, the remaining two dimensions that a country is measured on are concerned with human trafficking after the act has occurred (prosecution of the trafficker, protection of victims). As transit countries<sup>9</sup> and destination countries are not the same as the victim's country of origin, it is understandable that this index may not affect the likelihood of a woman being trafficked out of a country. It may even be the case that a country that is focused on the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Or countries that victims are taken to before their destination country

prosecution of traffickers and protection of victims that it may have allocated all of its antihuman trafficking resources to post-trafficking efforts rather than preventative efforts. This would render a country that scores high on the index as actually more likely to create victims of human trafficking, as the direction of this coefficient suggests. Additionally, this finding may also be the result of the inherent flaws in cross-sectional designs. A time series approach might find that as anti-trafficking laws are put into place, trafficking starts to decline. Thus, while it may decrease the levels of incoming trafficking, a high score on Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer's Anti-Trafficking index does seem to increase the level of outbound trafficking from a country.

The coefficients of six of the nine hypotheses were not statistically significant--  $H\Box$ ,  $H\Box$ ,  $H\Box$ ,  $H\Box$ ,  $H\Box$ , and  $H\Box$ . Of these variables, two of the coefficients narrowly avoided statistical significance with a two tailed test--  $H\Box$  and  $H\Box$ . However, using a one tailed test, both of these coefficients demonstrate statistical significance. H I states that as prostitution becomes legal, the amount of human trafficking out of that country will decrease. While a country's legal stance on prostitution may render it more vulnerable to being a receiver of trafficking victims (as a transit/destination country), as Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer first suggest (2012b) and as this thesis also suggests, legal prostitution has an adverse effect on the outflow (from origin countries) of human trafficking. This is likely due to two reasons. First, where prostitution is legal, there are likely enough women in these countries willing to engage in commercial sex that they can support their country's demand for it (Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer 2012b). Second, in countries where prostitution is legal, sex workers often form strong unions to ensure the rights of sex workers. These unions are likely to advocate against coerced inclusion of sex trafficking victims as they believe that sex work should be voluntary and as the influx of victims would affect their livelihood.

As the scale used here for prostitution is 0 for completely illegal, 1 for partially legal, and 2 for completely legal, this means that a difference of 2 units is the largest variation that could occur between countries for this variable. As the coefficient for this variable is -.2210, the largest effect that the legal state of prostitution could have on the dependent variable would be -.442. The marginal effects of prostitution when averaging all other covariates are a 3.41 score on the DV when prostitution illegal, a 3.72 score when prostitution is partially legal, and a 2.97 score when prostitution is completely legal. What is interesting about these findings is the U-shaped effect prostitution has on trafficking, which suggests that the legal status of prostitution does not have a linear effect on human trafficking outflows.

Another hypothesis that narrowly avoided statistical significance is H $\Box$ , which states that as the share of women employed in the nonagricultural sector increases, the amount of human trafficking out of that country will decrease. Although the coefficient for this variable is not statistically significant in a two tailed test, it is statistically significant using a one tailed test. Thus, this variable is worth exploring for several reasons. First, the direction of the coefficient is contrary to what I hypothesized. Perhaps the main reason that this variable did not go in the anticipated direction is due to potential measurement error. Recall that female non-agricultural employment is used as a proxy for societal patriarchy. In societies that are deeply rooted in patriarchy, women are subjected to second-class citizenry in various ways, notably via not even being allowed to work. Thus, a country that has high rates of non-agricultural employment amongst women could be one whose women are employed in more skilled sectors for which wages are higher, suggesting that they are less likely to be subject to patriarchal dominance. However, this may not always be the case. In some societies, higher-paying jobs are much more accessible to men than they are to women. With more men employed in better paying positions, a greater amount of low-paying jobs are made available. Pay differentials continue even in advanced industrial countries, as does the dominance of men in higher-paying professions. Depending upon the country's receptiveness to outsourcing, this could lead to a higher percentage of women employed in low-paying factory or "maquiladora" type work. The term "maquiladora" refers to work in factories which provide unskilled, low-wage work opportunities for export (Lederman and Oliver 2013). Poor work conditions in the South may mean that movement out of the agriculture sector does not improve the economic opportunities for women, due to exploitative conditions in many outsourced manufacturing industries, thus rendering the measure of patriarchy problematic. Also, displacement of workers from the countryside to the cities in search of outsourced manufacturing jobs may actually help traffickers by concentrating their targets in easier-to-access locations. Thus, given the disparate meanings to "nonagricultural" employment, the fact that a higher percentage of women employed in the nonagricultural sector does not necessarily mean that women are less likely to be trafficked from these countries makes sense.

Four hypotheses were not supported via statistically significant coefficients of their variables--H $\Box$ , H $\Box$ , H $\Box$ , and H $\Box$ . H $\Box$  states that as the ratio of girls to boys that complete primary and secondary schools increases, the level of human trafficking out of that country will decrease. Access to education amongst girls can be viewed as a proxy for patriarchy. As patriarchal states are ones that don't value and often restrict women, which literature suggests often leads to the greater likelihood of them being trafficked, the fact that this relationship is not supported in this thesis is surprising. A possible explanation for this could be that ratios of school completion do not accurately assess the quality of the education that girls receive, thus rendering them susceptible to being trafficked despite having completed significant schooling.

 $H\square$  states that the more democratic a country's government is, the less likely it is to experience an outflow of human trafficking. As democracies generally grant greater opportunities to women and as literature suggests that fewer opportunities for women often make them susceptible to being trafficked, the fact that this relationship is not supported is surprising. A possible explanation for this is that authoritarian states may instead suppress women's opportunities and rights in other ways, even to such an extent that restricts the ability of women to exit the country in groups (as traffickers presumably operate).  $H\Box$  states that as GDP per capita PPP of a given state increases, the volume of human trafficking out of that state will decrease. One potential reason that this hypothesis is not supported is that in the world's poorest nations with extremely low GDPs, families are often depended upon for the labor of their children in order to survive and may thus be sold to traffickers less often. Thus this finding, while initially surprising, is understandable. Lastly,  $H\Box$  states that the more recently a country has experienced civil conflict, the greater the amount of human trafficking flowing out of that country. This hypothesis is not supported likely due to the reason that the results of civil conflict can take longer to be fully realized or may have a U-shaped effect.

In sum, the results of the relationships between each independent variable and the dependent variable are as follows:

## **Table IV: Summary of Results**

Independent Variable	Expected Relationship	Estimated Relationship	Hypothesis Supported
Education $(\mathbb{Q}: \mathcal{J})$	-	-	Yes
$\bigcirc$ in Non-Agricultural sector	-	+	No
GDP per capita, PPP	-	+	No
Polity IV scores	-	-	Yes
Gov. seats held by $\stackrel{\bigcirc}{\rightarrow}$	-	-	Yes
Last civil conflict	+	-	No
Corruption Scores	-	-	Yes
Cho, et al. Anti-trafficking Index	-	+	No
Legality of prostitution	-	-	Yes

## Incidence of Reporting of Origin Countries for Human Trafficking

### **II. Robustness Checks**

In order to check for robustness of these data, I ran several models to examine the effects of dropping one variable at a time were on the statistical significance of the coefficients of the other independent variables. Results are shown on page 36:

## Table V: Summary of Models

# Incidence of Reporting of Origin Countries for Human Trafficking

Variables	model1	model2	model3	model4	model5	model6	model7
<b>Education</b> (♀:♂)	-0.007	-0.005	-0.021	-0.004	-0.008	0.001	
	(-0.016)	(-0.016)	(-0.016)	(-0.018)	(-0.016)	(-0.014)	
$\stackrel{\frown}{_{\!$	0.023	0.022	0.035**	0.029*	0.023	0.025	0.021
sector							
	(-0.013)	(-0.013)	(-0.012)	(-0.014)	(-0.013)	(-0.013)	(-0.012)
GDP per capita, PPP	0.184	0.182	0.291	-0.157	0.187		0.15
(logged)							
	(-0.164)	(-0.166)	(-0.165)	(-0.151)	(-0.163)		(-0.144)
Polity IV	-0.01	-0.028	0.012	-0.023		-0.01	-0.011
	(-0.023)	(-0.021)	(-0.023)	(-0.025)		(-0.023)	(-0.023)
Gov. seats held by $\bigcirc$	-0.025*	-0.025*	-0.022	0.30*	-0.024*	-0.027*	0.026*
	(-0.012)	(-0.012)	(-0.013)	(-0.013)	(-0.012)	(-0.012)	(-0.012)
Last Civil Conflict	-0.008	-0.002	0.012	0.002	-0.007	-0.012	-0.017
	(-0.026)	(-0.026)	(-0.026)	(-0.028)	(-0.026)	(-0.026)	(-0.026)
Corruption Scores	-	-0.399***	-0.364***		-0.392***	-0.327***	-0.383***
_	0.386***						
	(-0.099)	(-0.1)	(-0.103)		(-0.097)	(-0.084)	(-0.098)
Cho, et al. Index	0.148**	0.159**		0.130*	0.141**	0.164**	0.156**
	(-0.055)	(-0.056)		(-0.06)	(-0.052)	(-0.054)	(-0.052)
Legality of Prostitution	-0.221		-0.256*	-0.255	-0.244*	-0.22	-0.216
	(-0.123)		(-0.128)	(-0.134)	(-0.11)	(-0.124)	(-0.122)
Constant	2.023	1.656	3.236*	3.327*	2.164	2.417	1.635
	(-1.312)	(-1.315)	(-1.281)	(-1.385)	(-1.258)	(-1.267)	(-0.99)
R-squared	0.364	0.336	0.301	0.231	0.362	0.353	0.362
N	83	83	83	83	83	83	83

OLS Regression \*p<.05, \*\*p<.01, \*\*\*<.001

From this table, several effects are evident. Recall that in the OLS regression used for this thesis (model 1) three variables are statistically significant at the 95% confidence interval. In Table IV, these three variables (corruption scores, percentage of parliamentary seats held by women, and Cho. et al.'s Index scores) retain their statistical significance in six out of the seven models. Only once does the percentage of parliamentary seats held by women lose statistical significance (when the Cho et al. Index variable is dropped). Further, these models suggest that the corruption variable is perhaps the most influential and most explanatory variable in this study. This is evident in the fact that the R-squared value drops significantly, by .13 points, to .231 when corruption is taken out of the regression. These findings suggest that the data used is robust.

There are several additional effects that these models demonstrate. First, as demonstrated in model 3, by dropping the Cho et al. Anti-Trafficking Index variable, the percentage of women in parliamentary seats loses statistical significance. Parliaments that have a high percentage of female representatives are more likely to support women's rights and to lobby for more stringent anti-trafficking legislation. Recall that Cho et al.'s Anti-Trafficking Index rates countries on their "3Ps"—prosecution of traffickers, prevention of trafficking, and protection of victims of human trafficking. Thus, these two variables seem to be capturing at least partially the same effect on human trafficking outflows. Hence, it is somewhat perplexing that the percentage of women in parliament loses its statistical significance when the Cho et al. variable is dropped. However, a closer examination shows that the percentage of women in parliament only marginally loses its statistical significance. While the variable is not statistically significant at the 95% confidence interval via a two tailed test, it is statistically significant in a one tailed test

at the 90% confidence interval. Thus, the effect of the Cho et al. variable on the percentage of women in parliament is not terribly significant.

Another effect evident in model 3 is that the percentage of women employed in the nonagricultural sector becomes statistically significant when the Cho et al. variable is dropped. Although Cho et al.'s index examines states' prosecution of traffickers, prevention of trafficking, and protection of victims of human trafficking, the authors note that the "highest commitments" of states typically come from the prosecution of traffickers (Cho et al. 2012a). This suggests that states are more concerned with punishing criminals than they are with protecting people from becoming victims or helping them once they've been trafficked. This regard of the prevention and protection of victims as a matter of secondary importance is perhaps echoed by states that have high percentages of women employed in the non-agricultural sector. While some sectors of work may be deemed "non-agricultural" they may still refer to areas of employment that are comparable in labor intensity and low wages. Therefore, it makes sense that a country that has a high rate of women employed in the non-agricultural sector could also be a country that is less concerned with preventing its women and girls from being trafficked. Thus, the fact that dropping Cho et al.'s index from the regression yields statistical significance for the percentage of women employed in the non-agricultural sector makes sense. It is also worth noting that while the R-squared value does drop by .06 when Cho et al.'s index is left out (from .364 in model 1 to in .301 in model 3), this change is relatively low, thus suggesting that Cho et al.'s index's effect is not entirely mimicked by the percentage of women employed in the nonagricultural sector.

The percentage of women employed in the non-agricultural sector also becomes statistically significant when the corruption variable is dropped. In explaining how corruption

leads to greater outflows of human trafficking, the UNODC (2011) cites reasons similar to the criteria quantified in Cho et al.'s Anti-Trafficking Index, such as states' unwillingness to assist victims of human trafficking. The inaction (i.e. letting traffickers enter and exit states with victims) as well as the action (i.e. state officials returning trafficking victims to their captors) of corrupt states towards victims can both contribute to greater outflows of human trafficking. Again, a state that has a high percentage of women employed in the non-agricultural sector can mean that a substantial portion of females are employed in jobs that are similarly as labor-intensive and low-wage yielding as agricultural work (i.e. industrial, maquiladora type work). Thus, as a corrupt state is one not generally concerned with the wellbeing of minorities and one that often aids human trafficking operations, it makes sense that corrupt states would also likely be states that have high percentages of women employed in the non-agricultural sector. In short, it is logical that the corruption variable is capturing some of what the female non-agricultural employment variable explains as well, thus resulting in the statistical significance of the latter when corruption is dropped from the regression.

Additionally, when the polity variable is removed from the regression, the prostitution variable gains statistical significance. Polity scores examine the type of government under which a state operates, from autocracies to democracies. As democracies typically extend rights and liberties to minorities at greater levels than non-democracies, we would expect prostitution to be legal in a democratic state. A simple comparison of the states in which prostitution is legal or partially legal demonstrates similar polity scores that represent democracies. Thus, it makes sense that the prostitution variable becomes statistically significant when the polity variable is left out of the regression. The R-squared value drops only .002 points in comparing the model

used in this thesis to the model that drops the polity scores (model 5), thus suggesting that polity scores may not have a considerable effect on the outflows of human trafficking.

Lastly, the models that demonstrate the effects of removing the gdplog and education variables (models 6 and 7, respectively) yield the same statistical significance of the remaining independent variables as well as relatively similar coefficients. GDP and rates of educational access are often highly correlated since richer nations can afford to educate their children and as they typically extend educational access to all children at equal rates. Thus, it is logical that these two models where education and GDP (logged) are dropped have similar impacts on the remaining variables and similar R-squared values as well.

In conclusion, in attempting to ensure the robustness of the data used in this thesis, I created six additional models that demonstrated the effects of dropping some of the independent variables. That these models maintain similar R-squared values when one variable is dropped from the regression demonstrates the integrity and uniqueness of these data. In short, these models suggest that my findings are robust.

### **III.** Conclusion

In sum, of the nine independent variables studied, statistically significant relationships were found between five of the independent variables and the dependent variable. Three of the variables were statistically significant at the 95% confidence interval with a two tailed test and an additional two variables were statistically significant using a one tailed test. The relationship that was statistically significant at the strictest p-value possible (.000) exists between the corruption scores and the dependent variable (trafficking outflows). Second, the hypothesis that predicts an inverse relationship between the percentage of women in national parliament and the amount of human trafficking outflows is also supported. However, there is one variable that is

statistically significant and went in the direction contrary to the hypothesis. This hypothesis is that the higher the score a country receives in Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer's Anti-Trafficking Index (2011), the less human trafficking that will flow out of that country. Additionally, the two variables statistically significant with a one tailed test are the percentage of women employed in the non-agricultural sector and the legal status of prostitution. The percentage of women employed in the non-agricultural sector operated contrary to the hypothesis, suggesting that higher rates of trafficking emerge out of countries with higher non-agricultural employment amongst women. The legal status of prostitution, however, operates in accordance with my hypothesis in suggesting that there is less sex trafficking out of a country where prostitution is legal.

As many of the independent variables are somewhat related to each other, such as education and non-agricultural employment, type of government and percentage of women in national parliament, etc., I tested for robustness and multicollinearity. The findings of my robustness tests are described in section II of this chapter and generally suggest that my data is robust. In order to test for multicollinearity, I ran variance inflation factor (vif) tests for the independent variables. The mean vif was found to be 1.80, which implies that the variables are unique and independent of each other, as intended (Allison 2012). While running a correlation test did demonstrate high correlations between some variables, such as between GDP per PPP and corruption (.6688, the highest correlation) as well as between the rates of primary and secondary school enrollment for girls compared to boys and the percentage of women employed in the non-agricultural sector (.5586), the fact that the vif scores were all quite low eliminates the concern that somewhat elevated correlation values raises. In an effort to further test for correlation, I also created an interaction term that combined the ratio of girls to boys enrolled in

primary and secondary school and the percentage of women employed in the non-agricultural sector. Introducing this interaction term elevated vif scores to an average of 54.92, due to the vif of 301.38 (for the interaction term itself), 219.35 (for non-agricultural employment) and 16.12 (for education). Consequently, I elected to keep the original regression which did not include the interaction term and maintained low vif scores, thus yielding the analysis provided here.

### **Chapter IV: Discussion and Further Research**

This research explores how multiple factors affect the amount of human trafficking flowing from a country. In considering what leads to a greater outflow of trafficking, I essentially considered what contributes to the greater likelihood of victimization. Taking this victim-centered approach to human trafficking is the most sensible way to combat its growing frequency. While intensifying the consequences for those caught and convicted of trafficking may deter some activity, it simply is not enough. Where there is the prospect of gain particularly renewable and very lucrative financial gain-there will be traffickers who consider the potential reward to outweigh the potential cost. Demand is also unlikely to change much as commercial sex has occurred for centuries. Further, focusing efforts on the protection of victims after they have been discovered, while certainly necessary, is perhaps of secondary importance if the mission is to reduce future victims. Thus, I felt it was important to examine factors that contribute to human trafficking that are popularly used in human trafficking studies (such as access to education) as well as other variables that are derived from my own interpretations and applications of larger themes that contribute to human trafficking. For example, while it is commonly believed that high unemployment rates may contribute to greater human trafficking outflows, I chose a variable that would measure to what extent a more specific type of employment (female non-agricultural) affects the volume of human trafficking. Thus, my

research provides some specific suggestions (via statistically significant findings) as to how human trafficking may be combatted as well as some avenues for further research.

Statistically significant relationships are found between five of the independent variables and the dependent variable. The variables that measured the level of corruption in a state, the number of female representatives in national parliament, and Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer's Anti-Trafficking Index are statistically significant at the 95% confidence interval with a two tailed test. First, this suggests that the more corrupt a state is the greater outflow of human trafficking it is likely experience. As corrupt states often contribute to and allow illicit activities to occur without consequence, this relationship between corruption and trafficking outflows is logical and straightforward. Second, the findings in this thesis suggest that states with higher percentages of female political representatives experience smaller outflows of human trafficking. As females representatives are more likely to advocate for increased human and women's rights and stiffer penalties for human traffickers who violate these rights, this relationship also makes sense. Third, the findings in this thesis suggest that there is an inverse relationship between a state's anti-trafficking policies and the state's volume of outbound trafficking. This result is perplexing in that it seems logical that a state that ranks highly for its anti-trafficking policies would be more active in combating trafficking and thus see less outbound trafficking from their country as a result. However, as this score is a composite of prevention and protection of trafficking victims and prosecution of traffickers, it is likely that states are less focused on their actions to prevent human trafficking, thus resulting in high outflows of trafficking. Further, it is also possible that stronger anti-trafficking laws simply exist where the problem is already at its worst, suggesting that states are succumbing to international political pressure if nothing else to at least

seem like they are trying to combat trafficking. Overall, there are several reasons that this result was contrary to what was expected.

Two additional variables that are found to be statistically significant at the 90% confidence interval with a one tailed test are the percentage of women employed in the nonagricultural sector and the legal status of prostitution. The findings in this research suggest that a country that has a high percentage of women employed in the nonagricultural sector have higher outflows of human trafficking. Nonagricultural employment-- especially in lesser developed nations where human trafficking is prevalent-- can mean work that is just as labor-intensive and poorly paid as agricultural work. Thus, it is logical that high employment in nonagricultural sectors (i.e. industrial or factory work) may leave women more vulnerable to deceptive appeals regarding employment abroad. Second, the findings in this research suggest that states that have a legal status of prostitution are likely to have less human trafficking outflows from their state. This is logical as states where prostitution is legal likely have enough sex workers from the state itself to satiate demand for commercial sex and as these sex workers are more likely to advocate against forced entry into the commercial sex industry.

As these five variables are statistically significant at high confidence intervals, these findings serve as plausible ways that countries may be able to decrease the number of their people trafficked. For example, the relationship between Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer's anti-trafficking scale and trafficking outflows suggests that states that have greater anti-trafficking policies in place are actually more likely to experience higher outflows of human trafficking than states with poorer anti-trafficking policies. While certainly states should attack human trafficking with aggressive anti-trafficking policies, this finding suggests that states need to be better focused on precisely what this thesis argues—a victim-centered approach. Simply reviewing the

scores that Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer assigned to states based upon their 3Ps (prevention of trafficking, prosecution of traffickers, and protection of victims), it is clear that states' antitrafficking policies emphasize primarily, the prosecution of traffickers and secondarily, protection of victims (after they've been trafficked). Thus, perhaps the reason this variable has an inverse relationship with the dependent variable is because states are not doing enough to prevent their people from becoming victimized via human trafficking. If states focus greater efforts on preventing human trafficking rather than attempting to rectify instances once they've occurred, it is likely this would yield smaller outflows of trafficking.

Additionally, this thesis suggests that states that have higher percentages of female representatives in parliament have smaller outflows of human trafficking. While a significant increase in female political representation is not likely to occur quickly, nor are the results of such likely to be immediately apparent, one example that may support this finding is Rwanda. Rwanda's female political representation grew from 18% (pre-genocide) to near gender parity, with 48.8% of government seats held by women in 2003 (Powley 2008). Although it is still too early for the full effects of this shift to be captured, research notes that women have won the right to inherit land as a result of increased political representation (Kielburger and Kielburger 2007). Further, all Rwandans have benefitted from increased healthcare and education funding, with researchers suggesting that further social improvements will continue to grow (Powley 2008, (Kielburger and Kielburger 2007). Thus, as bleak social and economic conditions are what often lead women into trafficking, and as increased female political representation can improve social and economic conditions for women, then states seeking to reduce their trafficking outflows may consider ways to integrate more women into their national governments.

These three variables—levels of corruption, the percentage of female representatives in national parliament, and Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer's Anti-Trafficking Index-measure institutions' actions to combat human trafficking. The actions of institutions, while they measure actions on an aggregated level, do affect individuals. For instance, corrupt or poor governmental institutions increase human trafficking because they are not generally concerned with the wellbeing of their people. Conversely, stronger institutions take better care of their people and promote stronger social values--evident in states with more broadly representative governments (i.e. higher percentages of female parliamentary representatives). Thus, it makes sense that stronger institutions experience smaller outflows of human trafficking. Further, more stable governments are able to better promote anti-trafficking policies which should, in theory, decrease levels of outbound trafficking. Although the findings in this thesis contradict this hypothesis (for reasons discussed previously), these institution-level variables serve to emphasize that good governance—whether operationalized as non-corrupt, broadly representative, or as a state with a strong-anti trafficking stance—is to be considered a solution to quell outflows of human trafficking. Thus, while these variables are institution-level factors, they do still suggest ways that individuals may be more or less likely to become victims of human trafficking.

The findings in this thesis also suggest further areas of research. First and most obviously, this research urges for better measurement of the dependent variable--trafficking outflows from states. The UNODC should consider greater efforts to classify data than simply counting each reported case as one instance as an attempt to cancel out the possible effect of doubly counting a case. The scale should also be re-coded by placing smaller numbers of reported instances into tiers (i.e. five instances per tier) and consequently increasing the number of tiers so as to provide a broader measure of trafficking outflows (i.e. tier 1: 1-5 reports...tier

10: 45-50 reports, etc.). Re-coding the scale would allow for states to be compared more carefully to each other and thus allow for more specific conclusions about human trafficking outflows to be drawn. Additionally, the UNODC should consider collecting data over time. By doing so, researchers would be able to track changes in trafficking outflows with greater accuracy. Overall, if the UNODC increases the size of the scale and the span of time in which data are collected, this would allow for greater quantitative and qualitative research regarding the frequency and patterns of trafficking outflows.

As the percentage of female representatives in parliament is not likely to change drastically over a period of just a few years, this too provides an area that is worthy of further research in relation to human trafficking outflows. In addition to Rwanda, South Africa, Norway, and Italy have also recently subscribed to female parliamentary quotas at the national level (30%, 30%, 40%, and 31% respectively). As mentioned previously, while the effects of these quotas will likely only be visible over time, these countries could provide an interesting set of case studies for those seeking to measure the effects of female representation on trafficking outflows. Further, considering a wider spectrum of legal statuses of prostitution may also provide greater insight into its effect on trafficking outflows. For instance, prostitution may be deemed "legal" meaning that it is legal to sell sex but illegal to purchase sex. Thus, coding to acknowledge a difference in the variations of legality may facilitate a deeper understanding of how prostitution affects trafficking outflows.

While international actors may collectively urge countries worldwide to integrate more women into parliamentary positions or to specifically take actions to decrease human trafficking, it would be difficult to enforce penalties if countries do not comply. However, if uncooperative states were faced with a combination of social and economic sanctions for their inaction, this

may act as a large incentive for them to comply. As poor economic statuses often contribute to women becoming victims of human trafficking, it is only fitting to punish countries that have high outflows of human trafficking in a way that would impair them economically. If economic powerhouses that do not experience high outflows of human trafficking, such as the U.S., create severe economic penalties (i.e. increased import taxes, cease of trade relationships, loss of foreign aid, etc.) for countries that do not treat this growing epidemic with the urgency that it deserves, this may assist in a radical decrease of the amount of human trafficking victims claimed worldwide. However, in order for these actions to yield large-scale results, work and cooperation on an international scope must take place. Thus, it is the duty of all countries particularly example setting ones that are ranked lowest as 'feeder' countries of trafficking victims-- to fight human trafficking in any way they can. Also, as with many social issues, the naming and shaming that is often a result of poor national policies on human trafficking is often an effective tactic that prompts state action. By denouncing the actions or inactions of states, these countries would be strongly urged if not forced to take a stronger stance against human trafficking. Thus, imposing economic and social consequences for countries that consistently have high outflows of human trafficking may help decrease the amount of outbound human trafficking occurring worldwide.

As human trafficking is largely understood to be an act that occurs out of either desperation or coercion, one additional way that human trafficking levels may be able to be quelled is via a larger, globalized discussion about human trafficking. This should be carried out in the form of more expansive, preventative programs at the national level of all states. This could range from increased billboards and radio advertisements warning at-risk groups about trafficker's tactics to taking greater strides to educate girls and their families formally about

human trafficking, such as in a school setting. This could also be done informally such as by strategically informing people from more rural areas about traffickers in places that they frequent. By promoting awareness and education about trafficking and the recruitment methods used by traffickers in areas such as markets (where rural families frequent for subsistence) or even factories (where poorer, more disadvantaged prospective victims work) this would allow regions full of people who may be more susceptible to being trafficked to be made aware of human trafficking. Another way that knowledge about human trafficking might be better spread is via passports. Many stories of victims begin with them naively handing over their passports to their traffickers only to realize too late that they now lack the very document necessary to get them out of their country of transit or destination. In response to this, I propose that international provisions on passports allocate a prominent page for an explicit warning about the dangers of human trafficking, specifically in relinquishing one's passport to any other person. Although many victims of human trafficking are transported through illicit means without their passports, this unconventional method of prevention is one worth considering in response to the victims that remain such due to having forfeited their passports.

Lastly, many researchers contend that while more research needs to be done on human trafficking, there simply are not means for it to be done. In response to this I propose a solution that may help human trafficking garner more attention on a general level as well as a research level. Considering how rampant human trafficking is and the incredible economic dimensions it has worldwide, the issue of human trafficking seems to be one that could easily merit greater study everywhere. As the topic is a large-scale issue that occurs at both the intra- and international levels, it seems suitable as an issue around which many diverse studies could occur. Thus, creating degree plans that focus on the factors that contribute to human trafficking could

have varied positive results. First, it could promote a more general understanding and thus possibly decrease the volume of human trafficking as more people would be aware of it. Second, courses and programs devoted to covering this issue and other human rights issues would prepare young people to become trained researchers that are so desperately needed to discover more about the phenomenon. As more and more universities worldwide recognize the need for academic focuses on human trafficking, this would perhaps also solicit greater financial provisions for studies that include but are not limited to case studies around the world. For instance, a partnership between The World Bank and a university that offers an academic program on human trafficking could yield young, capable, and skilled researchers who could complete more in-depth research on the topic, regarding population sizes as well as what the more specific driving forces are behind recruitment. In addition, further research needs to be conducted not just on sex trafficking but on the other types of work that trafficked people are forced to do. Srey Rath's story in the introduction could easily have been a story of a young girl trafficked and forced to live her life as a domestic servant, for example. Thus, data and victims accounts on all types of trafficking must be collected.

The findings in this thesis make substantial contributions to human trafficking research and add rich suggestions for where further research may be most fruitful. First, it is worth noting that of the two types of factors examined in this thesis (individual level and state level factors), the state level factors (corruption, percentage of women employed in the nonagricultural sector, Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer's Anti-Trafficking Index) are found to have statistical significance over individual level factors. This suggests that perhaps governmental factors affect human trafficking outflows more than social factors do. Further, this result may be a function of the inadequacy of data related to human trafficking. As previously discussed, the dependent variable

is an imperfect measure of the outflows of human trafficking. Thus, if anything, these results serve to add to the argument that better measurements and further research regarding human trafficking be conducted.

Additionally, this thesis examines a set of variables that are unique and contribute to a greater understanding of human trafficking. While research on human trafficking is limited, research specifically regarding the outflow of human trafficking is even more limited. This thesis serves to make a contribution to this area of very limited research in several ways. First, this thesis examines variables not previously used in many other human trafficking studies. For instance, while some studies may focus on unemployment rates of women as a determinant of trafficking outflows, I attempt to gain an even more specific knowledge of economic opportunities as they relate to women's likelihood of being trafficked by examining the percentage of women employed in the non-agricultural sector. This leads to more specific inferences of how women's opportunities affect trafficking outflows. Second, by examining variables not previously used in studies that explore human trafficking outflows—namely the percentage of women employed in nonagricultural employment and the legal status of prostitution—I examine factors that have not previously been considered to have an effect on trafficking outflows. Thus, my unique combination of variables and the fact that many of them are statistically significant serves as a considerable contribution to human trafficking research as well as a platform from which further research should lead.

In short, while none of the recommendations provided here may be achieved quickly or easily, the very fact that they exist means that decreasing the amount of human trafficking victims worldwide is achievable. However, in order to see a dramatic decrease in human trafficking, action must be taken on a global scale. Thus, it is our imperative as people of any

nation to urge national and international attention be turned to this growing epidemic and to demand change—whether it is political reform, gender equality, or a heavier academic/research focus on the issue--to stop the spread of human trafficking before it continues to claim the lives of innocent victims like Srey Rath or countless other invisible women.

### References

- Academy for Educational Development. 2013. "Individuals Interested in Helping to Combat Human Trafficking Toolkit." <u>http://www.humantrafficking.org/combat\_trafficking</u> (Accessed January 14, 2013).
- Allison, Paul. 2012. "When Can You Safely Ignore Multicollinearity?" Statistical Horizons. http://www.statisticalhorizons.com/multicollinearity (Accessed June 16, 2013).
- Bartilow, Horace. 2010. "Gender Representation and International Compliance Against Human Trafficking." Mimeo. (Accessed June 20, 2013).
- Bindrim, Kira and Clare Richardson. 2013. "Girls Just Wanna Have Fundamental Representation in Government." *Reuters*. <u>http://blogs.reuters.com/events/2013/03/07/quotas-women-government/</u> (Accessed May 12, 2013).
- Bolkovac, Kathryn. 2011. The Whistleblower: Sex Trafficking, Military Contractors, and One Woman's Fight for Justice. New York: Palgrave MacMillan.
- Center for Systemic Peace. 2011. <u>Polity IV Project</u>: Political Regime Characteristics and Transitions, 1800-2011. <u>http://www.systemicpeace.org/inscr/inscr.htm</u> (Accessed January 11, 2013).
- Chartsbin. 2013. "The Legal Status of Prostitution by Country." <u>http://chartsbin.com/view/snb</u> (Accessed March 11, 2013).
- Cho, Seo Young. 2012. "Modelling for Determinants of Human Trafficking". Economics of Security Working Paper 70, Berlin: Economics of Security. <u>http://www.economics-humantrafficking.net/mediapool/99/998280/data/WP70 Cho</u> <u>Modelling for Determinants.pdf</u> (Accessed May 12, 2013).
- Cho, S., Dreher, A., and Neumayer, E. 2012a. "The Determinants of Anti-trafficking Policies Evidence from a New Index." *Scandinavian Journal of Economics*. Forthcoming.
- Cho, S., Dreher, A., and Neumayer, E. 2012b. "Does Legalized Prostitution Increase Human Trafficking?" *World Development* 41 (1), 2013: 67-82. <u>http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\_id=1986065</u> (Accessed December 13, 2012).
- Chuang, Janie. 2006. "Beyond a Snapshot: Preventing Human Trafficking in the Global Economy." *Indiana Journal of Global Legal Studies* 13 (1): 137-163. <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.2979/GLS.2006.13.1.137</u> (Accessed March 29, 2013).
- Coalition Against Trafficking in Women- Asia Pacific. 2001. "Every Woman Has A Right: Not To Be Prostituted." *Off Our Backs* 31 (3): 7-9 <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/20836812</u> (Accessed March 29, 2013).

- Corrin, Chris. 2005. "Transitional Road for Traffic: Analysing Trafficking in Women from and Through Central and Eastern Europe." *Europe-Asia Studies* 57 (4): 543-560. <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/30043905</u> (Accessed March 29, 2013).
- Danailova-Trainor, G., Belser, P., 2006. "Globalization and the Illicit Market for Human Trafficking: An Empirical Analysis of Supply and Demand." ILO working paper No. 78, Geneva. <u>http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\_norm/---</u> <u>declaration/documents/publication/wcms\_081931.pdf</u> (Accessed June 3, 2013).
- Day of the Girl. 2012. "Girls Denied Education Worldwide." <u>http://dayofthegirl.org/girls-denied-education-worldwide/</u> (Accessed April 26, 2013).
- Dicola, A., Orfano, I., Cauduro, A., and Conci, Nicoletta. 2005. "Study on National Legislation on Prostitution and Trafficking in Women and Children." Transcrime. <u>http://lastradainternational.org/lsidocs/73%20Study%20on%20National%20Legislation%</u> 20(Transcrime,%20European%20Parliament).pdf (Accessed June 2, 2013).
- DoSomething.Org. 2012. "11 Facts about Education Around the World." <u>http://www.dosomething.org/tipsandtools/11-facts-about-education-around-world</u> (Accessed April 26, 2013).
- Europol. 2004. "Trafficking of Human Beings: A Europol Perspective" <u>http://www.europol.eu.int/.%5Cpublications%5CSeriousCrimeOverviews%5C2004%5C</u> <u>OverviewTHB2004.pdf</u> (Accessed June 3, 2013).
- Fenster, Tovi. 1999. Gender, Planning, and Human Rights. New York: Routledge.
- Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations. 2013. "Women, Agriculture, and Food Security." <u>http://www.fao.org/worldfoodsummit/english/fsheets/women.pdf</u> (Accessed April 26, 2013).
- Free the Slaves. 2013. "About Slavery." <u>https://www.freetheslaves.net/SSLPage.aspx?pid=348</u> (Accessed June 12, 2013).
- Gleditsch, N., Wallensteen, P., Eriksson, M., Sollenberg, M., and Strand, H. 2002. "Armed Conflict 1946–2001: A New Dataset." *Journal of Peace Research* 39(5): 615–637.
- Global Campaign for Education. 2012. "Gender Discrimination in Education: The Violation of Rights of Women and Girls Report." <u>http://campaignforeducation.org/docs/reports/GCE\_INTERIM\_Gender\_Report.pdf</u> (Accessed April 26, 2013).
- The Global Poverty Project. 2013. "Women and Poverty." <u>http://www.globalpovertyproject.com/infobank/women</u> (Accessed June 1, 2013).

- HumanTrafficking.Org. 2013. <u>"Individuals Interested in Helping to Combat Human</u> <u>Trafficking-Toolkit." http://www.humantrafficking.org/combat\_trafficking</u> (Accessed June 13, 2013).
- Internal Labor Organization. 2013. "New ILO Global Estimate of Forced Labour: 20.9 million Victims." <u>http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/news/WCMS\_182109/lang-</u>-en/index.htm (Accessed June 12, 2013).
- Inter-Parliamentary Union. 2006. "Women in National Parliaments." <u>http://www.ipu.org/wmn-e/arc/classif311206.htm</u> (Accessed May 1, 2013).
- Jakobsson, Niklas and Andreas Kotsadam. 2013. "The Law and Economics of International Sex Slavery: Prostitution Laws and Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation." *European Journal of Law and Economics*. 35 (1): 87-107. <u>https://gupea.ub.gu.se/bitstream/2077/22825/4/gupea\_2077\_22825\_4.pdf</u>
- Kara, Siddharth. 2009. Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Kelly, Liz, and Linda Regan. 2000. Stopping Traffic: Exploring the Extent of, and Responses to, Trafficking in Women for Sexual Exploitation in the UK. Police Research Series Paper no. 125. London: Home Office. <u>http://andreanetwork.pbworks.com/f/trafficking.pdf</u> (Accessed March 16, 2013).
- Kempadoo, Kamala and Jo Doezema, eds. 1998. *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition.* New York: Routledge Press.
- Kielburger, Marc and Craig. 2007. "Mothers of Rwanda raise a nation: Women make up 48.8% of members of Parliament." *The Toronto Star*. <u>http://www.equalvoice.ca/pdf/Rwanda.pdf</u> (Accessed May 7, 2013).
- Kristof, Nicolas and Sheryl WuDunn. 2010. Half the Sky: Turning Oppression into Opportunity for Women Worldwide. New York: Vintage Books.
- Kristof, Nicolas and Sheryl WuDunn. 2013. "Education." Half the Sky Movement. http://www.halftheskymovement.org/issues/education (Accessed June 10, 2013).
- Kristof, Nicolas and Sheryl WuDunn. 2012. "Sex Trafficking." Half the Sky Movement. http://www.halftheskymovement.org/issues/sex-trafficking (Accessed October 1, 2012).
- Leach, Fiona and Shashikala Sitaram. 2002. Microfinance and Women's Empowerment: a Lesson from India. *Development in Practice*. 12 (5): 575-588. <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/4029403</u> (Accessed October 11, 2012).
- Lederman, Daniel and Julia Oliver. 2013. "The Lessons of Mexico's Maquiladoras: Where Free Trade and Labor Rights Compete." WorldCrunch. <u>http://www.worldcrunch.com/business-finance/the-lessons-of-mexico-039-s-</u>

<u>maquiladoras-where-free-trade-and-labor-rights-compete/nafta-low-skilled-workers-globalization/c2s11434/</u> (Accessed June 1, 2013).

- Lehti, Martti and Kauko Aromaa. 2006. "Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation." *Crime and Justice*, 34 (1): 133-227. <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.1086/650306</u> (Accessed March 29, 2013).
- Mahmoud, Toman and Trebesch, Christoph. 2010. 'The Economics of Human Trafficking and Labour Migration: Micro Evidence from Eastern Europe." *Journal of Comparative Economics.* 38 (2) 173-188.
- McBride, Dorothy E. and Janine Parry. 2011. Women's Rights in the USA: Policy Debates and Gender Roles. New York: Routledge.
- Omaar, Rageh. 2012. "Slavery: A 21<sup>st</sup> Century Evil--Sex Slaves." Al Jazeera, March 25. <u>http://www.aljazeera.com/programmes/slaverya21stcenturyevil/2011/10/2011101013445</u> <u>4998749.html</u> (Accessed September 29, 2012).
- Omorodion, Francisca. 2009. "Vulnerability of Nigerian Second School to Human Sex Trafficking in Nigeria." *African Journal of Reproductive Health* 31 (2): 33-48. <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/20617109</u> (Accessed March 29, 2013).
- Oudtshoorn, Joyce. 2005. "The political debates on prostitution and trafficking of women." Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State, and Society. 12 (1): 141-155. http://muse.jhu.edu/journals/social\_politics/v012/12.1outshoorn.html
- Palmer, Barbara and Dennis Simon. 2008. Breaking the Political Glass Ceiling: Women and Congressional Elections (Women in American Politics). New York: Routledge.
- Papart, J., Rai, S. and Staudt, K. 2002. *Rethinking Empowerment: Gender and Development in a Global/Local World*. New York: Routledge.
- Persson-Strömbäck, Karin. 2010. "European Trade Unions, Sex Workers and Organizing Rights." <u>Nordic Prostitution Policy Reform</u>. <u>http://nppr.se/2010/11/15/european-trade-unions-sex-workers-and-organizing-rights/</u> (Accessed June 4, 2013).
- Powely, Elizabeth. 2008. "Rwanda: Women Hold Up Half the Parliament." *Women in Parliament: Beyond Numbers*. <u>http://www.idea.int/publications/wip2/upload/Rwanda.pdf</u> (Accessed May 22, 2013).
- Reed, E., Gupta, J., Biradavolu, M., Devireddy, V., and Blankenship, K. 2010. "The Context of Economic Insecurity and Its Relation to Violence and Risk Factors for HIV Among Female Sex Workers in Andhra Pradesh, India." *Public Health Reports* 125 (Supplement 4): 81-89. <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/41434923</u> (Accessed March 29, 2013).
- Samarasinghe, Vidyamali and Barbara Burton. 2007. "Strategising Prevention: A Critical Review of Local Initiatives to Prevent Female Sex Trafficking." *Development in*

*Practice* 17 (1): 51-64. <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/25548176</u> (Accessed March 29, 2013).

- Trafficking.Org. 2013. "Statistics." <u>http://trafficking.org/learn/statistics.aspx</u> (Accessed June 23, 2013).
- Transparency International. 2006. "Corruption Perceptions Index 2006." <u>http://archive.transparency.org/policy\_research/surveys\_indices/cpi/2006</u> (Accessed January 11, 2013).
- Tyldum, Guri and Anette Brunovskis. 2005. "Describing the Unobserved: Methodological Challenges in Empirical Studies on Human Trafficking." *International Migration* 43 (1 of 2): 17-34. <u>http://prosentret.no/?wpfb\_dl=495</u> (Accessed January 12, 2013).
- United Nations. 2000. "Girl Child." http://www.un.org/cyberschoolbus/briefing/girl/girlchild.pdf (Accessed April 25, 2013).
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. 2011. "Issue Paper: The Role of Corruption in Trafficking in Persons." <u>http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-</u> <u>trafficking/2011/Issue\_Paper - The\_Role\_of\_Corruption\_in\_Trafficking\_in\_Persons.pdf</u> (Accessed June 24, 2013).
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. 2012. "Human Trafficking." <u>http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/what-is-human-trafficking.html</u> (Accessed October 3, 2012).
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. 2006. "Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns Report." Anti-Human Trafficking Unit of the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, Global Programme against Trafficking in Human Beings. <u>http://www.unodc.org/pdf/traffickinginpersons\_report\_2006ver2.pdf</u> (Accessed February 12, 2013).
- United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime. 2013. "UNODC Report on Human Trafficking Exposes Modern Form of Slavery." <u>https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-</u> <u>trafficking/global-report-on-trafficking-in-persons.html</u> (Accessed January 16, 2013).
- United States Department of Homeland Security. 2012. "Combating Human Trafficking." <u>http://www.dhs.gov/topic/human-trafficking</u> (Accessed October 9, 2012).
- U.S. Department of Justice. Federal Bureau of Investigation. 2011. "Human Sex Trafficking." Federal Law Enforcement Bulletin, March. <u>http://www.fbi.gov/stats-</u> <u>services/publications/law-enforcement-bulletin/march\_2011/march-2011-leb.pdf</u> (Accessed October 9, 2012).
- U.S. Department of State, 2004. "The Link Between Prostitution and Sex Trafficking" Washington, D.C.: Bureau of Public Affairs. Human Trafficking: Data and Documents. Paper 38. <u>http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/humtraffdata/38</u> (Accessed June 10, 2013).

- U.S. Department of State. 2011. *Trafficking in Persons Report*. Washington, D.C.: Department of State. <u>http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/164452.pdf</u> (Accessed October 15, 2012).
- Wolbrecht, C., Beckwith, K. and Baldez, L. 2008. *Political Women and American Democracy*. Cambridge University Press.
- The World Bank. 2006a."GDP per capita, PPP (constant 2005 International \$)" <u>http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NY.GDP.PCAP.PP.KD?page=1 (</u>Accessed January 11, 2013).
- The World Bank. 2006b."Proportion of Seats Held by Women in National Parliaments (%)." <u>http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SG.GEN.PARL.ZS?page=1</u> (Accessed January 11, 2013).
- The World Bank. 2006c. "Ratio of Girls to Boys in Primary and Secondary Education (%)." <u>http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SE.ENR.PRSC.FM.ZS?page=1</u> (Accessed January 11, 2013).
- The World Bank. 2006d. "Share of Women Employed in the Nonagricultural Sector (% of total nonagricultural employment)." <u>http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.EMP.INSV.FE.ZS/countries/1W?order=wbapi da</u> <u>ta\_value\_2006%20wbapi\_data\_value&sort=asc&page=1&display=default</u> (Accessed January 11, 2013).

## Vita

The author was born in Chalmette, Louisiana. She obtained her Bachelor's degree in English, cum laude, from The University of Southern Mississippi in 2008. She joined the University of New Orleans political science graduate program to pursue a Master's in Political Science with a concentration in International Relations.